
**THE EFFECT OF PEER FEEDBACK ON STUDENTS ACHIEVEMENT IN WRITING
NARRATIVE TEXT AT GRADE ELEVEN OF SMK SWASTA 2 HKBP SIPOHOLON
ACADEMIC YEAR 2020/2021**

Jonrio Simatupang¹, Lamma Sihotang², Juandi Nababan³

jonsimatupang8@gmail.com

Lammasihotang98@gmail.com

Juandinababan8@gmail.com

Faculty Of Teacher's Training And Education, University Of Sisingamangaraja XII Tapanuli

Abstract

Jonrio Simatupang. 170502408. The Effect of Peer Feedback on Students Achievement in Writing Narrative Text . A Thesis. English Department. Faculty of Teacher's Training and Education. UNITA. 2021

This study aim is to find whether Peer Feedback effect on students achievement in writing. This study was conducted by using experiential design the population of this study was grade eleven of SMK Swasta 2 HKBP Sipoholon and the total sample was 38 students Two classes were chosen through random sampling. One class was used as the experimental group and another class as control group. The experimental group was taught by using Peer instrument used in this study was written test. The data were analyzed by using t- test. The result of computing the t-test obviously showed that t-observed (4,38) is higher than t-table (2.02) with the degree of freedom 36 (df=N-2) at the level of significance 0.05 two tail test. It showed that the application of Peer Feedback gives significant effect on Students achievement in writing

Keywords: *Effect; Writing; Peer Feeedback Method*

1. Introduction

One of the languages that have an important role in the world is English. it is a foreign language for Indonesians and it is used in many international activities as commerce, sport, science, education, and technology. Therefore, English must be taught and learnt at school.

The purpose of teaching English language at school is to develop the students' language skills. There are four major skills that should be mastered by students in learning English, namely listening, speaking, reading, and writing. Writing as a part of the language skills besides listening, speaking, and reading must be taught maximally by the teacher to the student. Wallace (2004: 15) states that writing skill for beginning students can benefit from learning and practicing one skill at a time. So, study writing skill can benefit for student to learn another aspect of language at once.

Nowadays, the ability to write has become an indispensable skill in the literate community. Writing is still hard and often frustrating the learners when they are asked to do it although English has been taught since from elementary class. Students are getting confused to start their writing because they are not interested in writing. Even though they have some ideas on their mind, they do not know how to express the idea into good composition. Harmer (2004:11) states that for many years the teaching of writing focused on the written product rather than the writing process. in other words, the students' attention was directed to the what rather than how of the text construction. during this Corona Virus 19 (Covid 19) Pandemic. The Indonesian people are now starting to carry out their daily activities as usual according to the health protocols recommended by the government. During the current Covid-19 pandemic, especially in education. The school implements online and offline learning. That is

what has been experienced and implemented by researchers who have participated in teaching practice programs (PPL) in schools. Based on observations made by researchers during the implementation of the teaching practice program (PPL), it is known that student learning achievement in writing is still low. They still have some difficulties in writing. There is another factor that makes writing is difficult skill for students. It is caused by the conventional way applied by the English teacher. The English teacher uses lecturing method, He only gives a topic, explains it, asks students to answer questions or write but teacher doesn't use appropriate strategies in teaching writing. As consequence, learning writing make them bored. The teacher must know the appropriate strategy in teaching writing so that the students feel more comfortable in learning writing. Based on the problems which are faced by the students, the researcher considers that it is necessary to find the possible solution to solve the problems.

One of the possible solutions is by applying an appropriate strategy in teaching writing.

There are some strategies that can be applied in teaching writing. Peer feedback strategy is one of the strategies that can be used. Peer feedback is as feedback that is given by peer. In writing activity, peer feedback means having other writer to read and to give feedback on what other writer has written. Organizing idea by using peer feedback focuses on generic structure of genre and the language features. Student as writer will get the input to organize ideas from other peer's feedback. Peer feedback is understood as having other students to read and to give comments, corrections, criticisms, and suggestions on what other students have written (Atay and Kurt, 2007:14).

1. The Problem of the Study

In line with the background of the study, the research problem is stated as follows: "Is there any effect of Peer Feedback strategy on students' achievement in writing narrative text?"

2. The Objective of the Study

The objective of the study is to find out the effect of Peer feedback on students' achievement in writing narrative text.

3. The Scope of the Study

One of the difficulties that are faced by the students in writing is organizing idea. Organizing ideas focus on the generic structure and language features. This study was focused on the effectiveness of applying Peer Feedback

in a meaningful form and to mentally interact with the message.

Narrative Text

Narrative text is any natural story that has more than one communicative purpose (Knapp P & M Watkins: 2005:210) the communicative purposes of Narrative text such as entertain the reader, convey moral lesson, changes social opinions and attitudes. Usually after reading a narrative text, the reader is entertained and caught the purpose of the story or the advice explicitly stated from the story.

Generic Structure of Narrative Text

According to Knapp P. and Watkins M (2005: 220) Generic structure of narrative text is constituted by the generic structures of orientation, evaluation, complication, resolution, and re-orientation.

- 1) Orientation: sets the scene, introduces the participants and personal attitudes.
- 2) Evaluation: a stepping back to evaluate the plight, usually to make the story more interesting.
- 3) Complication: a crisis arises; the complication can be one or more
- 4) Resolution: the crises is resolves, for better or for worse
- 5) Re-orientation (optional): a brief summary which is aimed to give or submit a moral lesson to the reader.

in developing students' achievement in writing narrative text. The two aspects of narrative text were studied, they are the generic structure and the language features.

4. The Significance of the Study

The study on the effect of applying Peer feedback in teaching on students' achievement in writing narrative texts is expected to give information to teachers as well as learners and especially to English teachers. It is useful in increasing students' ability in writing narrative texts. The last is to provide preliminary information for those who are interested in the same study.

Review of Related Literature

In conducting a research, theories are needed to explain some concepts applied. The explanation is considered important. The concepts which are used must be clarified in order to have the same perspective with the implementation in the field. The following ideas used in this study are as follows:

Writing Narrative Text

Writing is one of the four English language skills in addition to listening, speaking and reading. Writing skills are specific abilities which help writers put their thoughts into words

Narrative Text

Narrative text is any natural story that has more than one communicative purpose (Knapp P & M Watkins: 2005:210) the communicative purposes of Narrative text such as entertain the reader, convey moral lesson, changes social opinions and attitudes. Usually after reading a narrative text, the reader is entertained and caught the purpose of the story or the advice explicitly stated from the story.

Generic Structure of Narrative Text

According to Knapp P. and Watkins M (2005: 220) Generic structure of narrative text is constituted by the generic structures of orientation, evaluation, complication, resolution, and re-orientation.

- 1) Orientation: sets the scene, introduces the participants and personal attitudes.
- 2) Evaluation: a stepping back to evaluate the plight, usually to

make the story more interesting.

- 3) Complication: a crisis arises; the complication can be one or more
- 4) Resolution: the crises is resolves, for better or for worse
- 6) Re-orientation (optional): a brief summary which is aimed to give or submit a moral lesson to the reader.

Grammatical Feature of Narrative Text

Using past tense

The Simple Past Tense indicates that an activity began and ended at a particular time in the past. It is also used for a past habit. (Soeprapto & Darwis: 2006: 10). It uses past form of the verb or known as verb 2.

Example:

- We **went** to the theatre yesterday
- last week, I **bought** a new book

Using temporal circumstances and temporal conjunctions

Temporal Circumstance answers the questions "when?" and "how long? where" "when?" shows at what time or on what occasion something happens while "how long?" shows the duration of something happens.

Examples:

- Mega left for Tarutung **last week**.
- Jhon waited for his brother **since two hours ago**

Temporal conjunctions are conjunctions relating to time, such as: after, as soon as, at first, at once, before, finally, next, while, since, then, when, whenever, as, and now.

Student's Achievement in Writing Narrative Text

Based on Oxford Advanced Learner dictionary, by A.S Hornby (2000:11), achievement is something done successfully. Achievement is something obtained through skill and hard work. The term "achievement" also be defined as the condition that something has been done successfully with effort and

skill. Smith and Hudgins (1964:95) state that achievement is to do one's best, to be successful to accomplish tasks requiring skill and effort and to be recognized by authority.

Peer Feedback

According to Cambridge Advanced Learner's Dictionary (2008:973), peer is a person who is the same age or has the same social position or the same abilities as other people in a group. Feedback is information or statements of opinion about something, such as a new product, that provide an idea of whether it is successful or liked in writing class activity, Peer feedback is as feedback that is given by peer (students). it is means students not only composed their own text but read and to give comments, corrections, criticisms, and suggestions on the text written by other students.

Stages in Peer Feedback Activity

there are some stages in applying peer feedback Hyland (2002 : 203), they are :

1. Students must be introduced with narrative text. The teacher prepares example of narrative text and discuss the generic structure with the students. This stage is important because it is the starting point of whole stages
2. Distributing instruments (worksheet) that was used in the peer feedback activity to lead students to understand what their focuses are. The instruments contain aspect that was by the students in giving feedback. The instrument can be seen in table 2.1
3. Training students to do peer feedback activity, because student needs to understand peer feedback activity completely by doing that. Teacher shows example about how to give feedback in a good way and how to fill the worksheet
4. Group students. Teacher has to be selective in grouping the students. The teacher has to make sure that

Achievement in writing is a successful process of presenting ideas into right words which has formulated and organized well.

each group member will work cooperatively.

5. Students start writing their draft that is narrative text and then sharing their draft to other students
 6. Other students reading and giving feedbacks in their peer are writing
 7. Revising their draft.
- The last activity is reflection from what they have done in peer feedback activity.

Hypothesis

Based on the theoretical framework and conceptual framework above, the hypothesis can be stated as follows:

Ho: There is no effect of Peer Feedback strategy on students' achievement in writing narrative text

Ha: There is effect of Peer Feedback strategy on students' achievement in writing narrative text.

Research Design

This study was used an experimental research in order to find the effect of Peer Feedback strategy on students achievement in writing narrative text. In conducting experimental research, the subjects will be divided into two groups. The first groups are called as experimental group and the second one are called as control group. The first group or the experimental group is a group, which will give the treatment by using Peer Feedback. While the second group or the control group was given the lecturing method.

Experimental Group	Pre-test	Using Peer Feedback	Post-test
Control Group	Pre-test	Using Lecturing method	Post-test

Population and Sample

1. Population

According to Iskandar (2009 : 118) population is grand total of subject research which can be consisted of by the human being, object, animal, flora, symptom, assess the test or event as data source owning certain characteristic in a research.

The population of this study was grade Eleven of SMK Swasta 2 HKBP Sipoholon. There are consist of three classes with three majoring, light vehicle engineering, Motorcycle Bike Technique and Electric Power Installation Techniques. class consist of three classes, such as: XI TKR, XI TSM, XI LTR. The detail information about the total students of grade eleven of SMK Swasta 2 HKBP Sipoholon show in the following table.

Table 3.2
Total Population of Grade Eleven of SMK Swasta2 HKBP Sipoholon in Academic Year 2020/2021

NO	CLASS	NUMBER OF STUDENTS
1	XI TKR	13
2	XI TSM	18
3	XI LTR	7
TOTAL		38

2. Sample

According to Sugiyono (2003: 56) sample is "some of the amount and characteristic owned by population, according to Arikunto (2002:109). Sample must have the characteristics that represent all the population that observed in a research. If the population is less than or almost 100 persons, the researcher can take them all as the sample.

In this research the writer took all the population as sample . for this research is an experimental research, the 38 students will be divided into two groups, the first groups consist of 19 students and the second groups consist of 19 students . the first group is experimental , and the second group is control group. The 38 students (sample) used random sampling.

The Instrument for Collecting Data

In this study, instrument for collecting data was written test. Written test was used to assess the students' achievement in writing narrative text. Students was ask to write a narrative text.

Procedure of Research

In this study, there were three steps make to collect the data, they are:

Pre-test

Both groups were given the same test to know the students' writing ability before the treatment is given.

Treatment

The experimental group were taught by using Peer Feedback, while the control group were taught by using lecturing method. Each class were taught 5 x 90' including pre-test and post-test.

Post-test

Both groups were given a post-test after the treatment. It is used to find out the scores of the groups. The test is the same as the pre-test.

Scoring of the Test

In scoring the test of writing, the cumulative scores range from 1-100. The scoring of narrative writing test in this research based on the generic structures and grammatical features of narrative writing. Students passed if they got 70 based on the criteria of scoring. The scoring of narrative writing test can be seen in the table 3.3.

Table 3.3.
Scoring of the Test

Components	Criteria	Score
Generic Structure	Having Orientation	15
	Having Evaluation	15
	Having Compilation	15
	Having Resolution	15
	Having re-orientation	10

Grammatical Features	Using the right tense (past tense)	15
	Using Temporal Conjunction	15
Total		100

Technique of Data Analysis

t-test is used to test the different of each *t*-result from the two groups, namely *t*-table and *t*-observed. Furthermore, *t*-test has a function to test *H*₀ (null Hypothesis) and *H*_a (alternative Hypothesis) which are compared. The *t*-test formula was used in analyzing the data. The formula is :

$$t_{obs} = \frac{M_x - M_y}{\sqrt{\left(\frac{dx^2 + dy^2}{Nx + Ny - 2}\right)\left(\frac{1}{Nx} + \frac{1}{Ny}\right)}}$$

Where :

M_x : The mean score of experimental group

M_y : The mean score of control group

*dx*² : The standard deviation of experimental group

*dy*² : The standard deviation of control group

N_x : The total number samples of experimental group

N_y : The total number samples of control group

The Data and Data Analysis

The Data

This chapter discusses the data which was based on the data obtains during the process of research. As mentioned in the third chapter, the data were taken from pre-test and post-test administrated in experimental and control groups. Experimental group was taught by using Peer Feedback while control group was taught by using lecturing method.

TABLE 4
The Result of Pre-Test and Post – Test in Experimental Group

No	Initials	Pre-test	Post-test
1	AJH	63	75
2	BU	64	73
3	CIA	70	75
4	DEF	70	90

5	ETA	73	85
6	FAN	71	80
7	GU	65	82
8	HAI	65	68
9	IJA	71	78
10	JUN	60	80
11	KA	63	82
12	NIA	51	70
13	POR	54	60
14	RIA	60	76
15	SAN	56	78
16	TIM	57	79
17	ULS	67	87
18	YAN	60	88
19	YES	67	87
Total		1207	1493
Mean		63.5	78.6

From the table, it can be seen that the highest score of pre-test for Experimental group was 73, while the lowest score was 51. The mean score of pre-test in experimental group was 63.5. The highest score of post-test was 90. While the lowest score was 60. The mean score of post-test was 78.6.

TABLE 4

The Result of Pre-Test and Post – Test in Control Group

No	Initials	Pre-test	Post-test
1	ASE	54	60
2	BES	53	58
3	CAD	46	54
4	DRF	60	65
5	EFT	53	60
6	GAH	68	70
7	HU	67	73
8	IAN	60	68
9	JUL	68	77
10	KAL	72	75
11	LOM	63	67
12	MON	63	70
13	NOP	45	68
14	OP	58	65
15	RUH	59	69
16	SER	65	68
17	TUR	58	65
18	UAS	56	58
19	YUS	48	52

Total		1116	1242
Mean		58.7	65.4

From the table, it can be seen that the highest score of pre-test for Control group was 72, while the lowest score was 45. The mean score of pre-test in Control group was 58.7. The highest score of post-test was 77. While the lowest score was 52. The mean score of post-test on Control group was 65.4.

Table 5
The Calculation of Experimental Group

No	Students' Initial Name	Pre-test (X ₁)	Post-test (X ₂)	Deviation (d)	Da (d-M)	da ²
1	AJH	63	75	12	-3.05	9.32
2	BU	64	73	9	-6.05	36.63
3	CIA	70	75	5	-10.05	101.06
4	DEF	70	90	20	-4.95	24.48
5	ETA	73	85	12	-3.05	9.32
6	FAN	71	80	9	-6.05	36.63
7	GU	65	82	17	-1.95	3.79
8	HAI	65	68	3	-12.05	145.27
9	IJA	71	78	7	-8.05	64.84
10	JUN	60	80	20	-4.95	24.48
11	KA	63	82	19	-3.95	15.58

12	NIA	51	70	19	3.95	15.58
13	POR	54	60	6	-9.05	81.95
14	RIA	60	76	16	0.95	0.90
15	SAN	56	78	22	6.95	48.27
16	TIM	57	79	22	6.95	48.27
17	ULS	67	87	20	4.95	24.48
18	YAN	60	88	28	12.95	167.63
19	YES	67	87	20	4.95	24.48
Total		1207	1493	286		882.95

Table 6
The Calculation Control Group

No	Students' Initial Name	Pre-test (X ₁)	Post-test (X ₂)	Deviation (d)	Da (d-M)	da ²
1	ASE	54	60	6	-0.63	0.40
2	BES	53	58	5	-1.63	2.66
3	CAD	46	54	8	-1.37	1.87
4	DRF	60	65	5	-1.63	2.66
5	EFT	53	60	7	-0.37	0.14
6	GAH	68	70	2	-4.63	21.45
7	HU	67	73	6	-0.63	0.40

8	IAN	60	68	8	1.3	1.8
9	JUL	68	77	9	2.3	5.6
10	KAL	72	75	3	-	13.
11	LOM	63	67	4	3.6	19
12	MON	63	70	7	3	6.9
13	NOP	45	68	23	0.3	0.1
14	OP	58	65	7	7	4
15	RUH	59	69	10	0.3	0.1
16	SER	65	68	3	3.3	11.
17	TUR	58	65	7	7	35
18	UAS	56	58	2	-	13.
19	YUS	48	52	4	3.6	19
					3	6.9
Total		11	12	126		378
		16	42	126		.42

The Data Analysis

In the above, it can be observed that there is a different score between pre-test and post-test in both experimental and control group. To find whether the use of Peer Feedback has a significant effect in Writing Narrative text, the result of the test was calculated by using t-test formula. The calculation (see appendix A) shows that :

$$t_{obs} = \frac{M_x - M_y}{\sqrt{\left(\frac{dx^2 + dy^2}{Nx + Ny - 2}\right)\left(\frac{1}{Nx} + \frac{1}{Ny}\right)}}$$

Where :

Mx : The mean score of experimental group

My : The mean score of control group

dx² : The standard deviation of experimental group

dy² : The standard deviation of control group

Nx : The total number samples of experimental group

Ny : The total number samples of control group.

$$M_x = 15,05$$

$$M_y = 6,63$$

$$da^2 = 882,95$$

$$db^2 = 378,4$$

$$N_x = 19$$

$$N_y = 19$$

$$\begin{aligned} t_{obs} &= \frac{M_x - M_y}{\sqrt{\left(\frac{dx^2 + dy^2}{Nx + Ny - 2}\right)\left(\frac{1}{Nx} + \frac{1}{Ny}\right)}} \\ &= \frac{12,05 - 6,63}{\sqrt{\left(\frac{882,95 + 378,4}{19 + 19 - 2}\right)\left(\frac{1}{19} + \frac{1}{19}\right)}} \\ &= \frac{8,42}{\sqrt{\left(\frac{1261,35}{36}\right)\left(\frac{2}{19}\right)}} \\ &= \frac{8,42}{\sqrt{\left(\frac{1261,35}{342}\right)}} \\ &= \frac{8,42}{\sqrt{3,688}} \\ &= \frac{8,42}{1,92} \\ &= 4,38 \end{aligned}$$

Research Finding

Based on the data analysis, it was found that the using of Peer Feedback gave significant effect on teaching narrative text. The students got improvement on their score. The students' score taught by using Peer Feedback was higher than score taught by using lecturing method. The difference scores were tested by using t-test. The result of t-test calculation showed that t-observed was higher than t-table (4.38 > 2.02) So, the use of Peer Feedback gave significant effect on students achievement in writing narrative text. There were also problems that found by the researcher. First the students were depended on the teacher's instruction in applying Peer Feedback. The students could not do the steps adequately. In order to solve this problem, the

researcher provided a sheet which was contained the steps of applying Peer Feedback including the explanation for each steps. The researcher also gave a brief explanation about Peer Feedback in the beginning of activity.

Second the students were worried about their friends' ability in revising their works. The students thought that their friends would make their works worse. The researcher ensured that such thing would not happen because the researcher had made the criteria for revising the students' works.

1. Conclusions and Suggestions

1. Conclusions

The conclusions of this research are drawn as the following:

1. The application of Peer Feedback in teaching writing narrative text can increase students' achievement.
2. Peer Feedback is one of effective strategies that can be used in teaching writing narrative text.

2. Suggestions

Based on the conclusions, suggestions are stated as the following:

1. English teachers are recommended to apply Peer Feedback in teaching writing narrative text since the strategy can significantly affect the students' writing achievement.
2. Students are needed to understand the steps of applying Peer Feedback.
3. Other Researchers develop the related study to give positive effect in teaching and learning.
4. Other Researchers are recommended to develop the students' competencies about the material and make sure that each student has equal competencies.

REFERENCES

1. Arikunto, S. 2002 *Prosedur Penelitian Suatu Pendekatan Praktek*. Jakarta: PT. Rineka Cipta.
2. Atay, D. and Kurt, G. 2007, The effects of Peer Feedback on the Writing Anxiety of Prospective Turkish Teachers of EFL. *Journal of Theory and Practice in Education* Vol3(1):12-23.
3. Brown, D. 2004. *Language Assessment Principles and Classroom Practice*. New York: Longman
4. Cambridge Advance Learner's Dictionary. Third Edition 2008, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
5. Harmer, J. 2004. *How to Teach Writing*. England: Longman.
6. Hornby, As. 2000. *Oxford Advanced Learners' Dictionary of Current English* Great Britain: Oxford University.
7. Hyland, K. 2002. *Teaching and Researching Writing*. Great Britain: Longman.
8. Iskandar, S. 2009. *Metodologi Penelitian Pendidikan*. Jakarta: Gaung Persada.
9. Knapp, P and M. Watkins. 200. *Genre, Text, Grammar. Technology for Teaching and Assessing Writing* University of New South Wales Press
10. Leo, S. 2007. *English for Specific purpose Essay Writing*. Yogyakarta: ANDI.
11. Pardiyo. 2007. *Pastibisa! Tegching Genre-Based Writing* Yogyakarta: ANDI.
12. Patel and Jain. 2008. *English Language Teaching (methods, tools, and techniques)*. Jaipur Sunrise.
13. Smith, Louis M, and Hudgins, Bryce B. 1964 *Educational Psychology An Application of Social and Behavioural Theory* New York. Alfred. A. Knopf.
14. Soeprapto, F. A and Darwis, M. 2006. *Linked to the World 1- English for Senior High School Grade X* Jakarta. Yudistira.

-
15. Sugiyono,P. 2003 *Metode Penelitian*. Bandung: Pusat Bahasa Depdiknas: CV Alf.
 16. Wallace, Tet al. 2004. *Teaching speaking listening and writing* IBE Genev.